

HORA'S ORIGINAL EMAIL TO ARCHIVEFREEDOM

```
>>>
> >>> =====
> >>> --- Heinrich Hora <h.hora@unsw.edu.au> wrote:
> >>>
> >>>> Sir/Madam,
> >>>>
> >>>> you published the text of Mr. Crothers "How I
> was
> >>>> expelled from the
> >>>> University of New South Wales (An example of
> the
> >>>> suppression of
> >>>> science)" and I may inofficially as a private
> >> person
> >>>> reply to this with
> >>>> the attached text. In order to give freedom of
> >>>> discussion I request you
> >>>> to consider my text to be included into your
> >>>> publications. If this is
> >>>> not accepted by your very important
> publications
> >> of
> >>>> real injustice in
> >>>> science developments, please reply.
> >>>>
> >>>> Thanks for your attention
> >>>> Regards
> >>>> Heinrich Hora
```

Dear Mr, Crothers,

You may permit me that I write an open letter to your statement "How I was expelled from the University of New South Wales (An example of the suppression of science)" by two reasons. First I should mention that I well understand you since I myself had problems with academic staff at my undergraduate studies, and second that I may have to tell you my view about your statements.

I fully understand what problems with academic university staff can be. When I studied physics from 1950 at the University Halle in East Germany, I was – following an advice by Prof. Friedrich Hund 1950 in Jena – that I was taking all examinations for the first three years with High Distinction when finishing my second year with exception of experimental physics where I got a Distinction only (in the not documented oral examination it turned out what David Hilbert has said that "physics is too difficult for physicists"). When trying my Diplom-Thesis research in theoretical physics, there was only an assistant professor (Mr. Max Hieke, no Dr.) since the former Professor Erich Kretschmann (you mentioned his work on relativitiy theory; he came after WWII from the University of Königsberg [see Immanuel Kant] to Halle) had just retired. Hieke had studied in Halle until 1945 under Adolf Smekal (Smekal-Raman effect) and from this time he knew a problem on elasto-mechanics which topic he gave to the student Othmar

Jentzsch who solved it. Hieke published the results only under his own name (Zeitschrift für Angewandte Mathematik und Mechanik, ZAMM, Vol. 34, p.121-139 (1954)). At this time Arnold Sommerfeld's lectures "Optik" had just been printed which I bought from West-Berlin. I lent the book to Hieke who simply repeated the text in his first lecture in theoretical physics. In a footnote, Sommerfeld mentioned the unsolved theory of the Goos-Haenchen effect and Hieke gave me the problem for a Diploma thesis.

Being familiar with integral equations and the Schmidt-Hilbert solution with infinite matrices, I could apply this to the Goos-Haenchen effect (latest paper for a new nuclear theory with application to the Wigner scattering: Laser and Particle Beams, 24, 35 (2006)). When I tried to prevent Hieke to do the same with my work what he did with the thesis of Jentzsch, I got then enormous problems with the University. Later, Hieke managed to get his PhD and soon became a professor.

This is to tell you why I am familiar how to deal with totally unqualified physicists in which situation I was saved only by Prof. Paul Goerlich, a worldwide famous solid state physicist and R&D director of Zeiss in Jena to finish my undergraduate studies.

Coming to your case: you were dealing with top-class physicists as seen from their numerous highest level publications (Victor Flambaum, nominated to the Nobel Prize, Chris Hamer, PhD from Gell-Mann at CalTech, John Webb etc. etc.) and they were trying to help you in an exceptional way. It is not a normal matter of course that Webb as supervisor changed for you the topic of the thesis and Prof. Michael Gal managed the needed regulations that you could change your thesis topic to a fundamental problem of relativity. You should be grateful for the chances you were permitted. You are claiming that you found a very revolutionary result. I cannot judge about its correctness nor can I be pressed to judge. I would wish that you are right and the world may congratulate you, but the same is with my colleagues at UNSW. If they could not be convinced that you are right there is never a force to press them to find a judgment if they could not find it from their experience. Any question about your result is simply open. Your statements include unproved and unjustified insulting remarks and this all under your severe claim that there is a suppression of scientific progress. My dear Mr. Crothers you should realize that this is not correct and is only disadvantageous to yourself.

Indeed the website ARCHIVE FREEDOM at <http://archivefreedom.org/academic.htm> is intending to disclose wrong scientific procedures and developments, and this is very good. Einstein in 1905 was wise enough only to submit his work on Brownian motion as thesis to the Zürich university. This could be understood by the examiners and he succeeded, though Einstein would not have been Einstein if he would not have published about 1930 in Annalen der Physik the "13 errors in his thesis which fortunately had not been spotted". He was clever enough not to use relativity for a thesis, this was too new and revolutionary. Later a paper was signed by more than 30 renown physicists that Einstein is completely wrong and the contemporaries said to him "how can you have the guts to claim your results, you as a single person against all these authorities". Maybe you have a similar revolutionary result – please, I let this question open – but your procedures to receive the acknowledgement were unwise to try this with a PhD thesis. Prof. Webb gave you the chance to finish your PhD with a topic which is reasonable for such a business. You and I hope others in similar cases should learn from such a situation.

You may understand that I cannot accept an unjustified criticism against the University of New South Wales or the School of Physics there, but especially against the Department of Theoretical Physics which I founded in 1975 with achieving a top level in results until my retirement 1992 with a splendid continuation by Victor Flambaum as Head.

Sincerely,
Heinrich Hora

HORA'S SUBSEQUENT EMAIL TO ARCHIVEFREEDOM

```
> > =====
> > --- Heinrich Hora <h.hora@unsw.edu.au> wrote:
> >
> >> Dear Dr. Christiano,
> >>
> >> my letter refers to the following of your
> >> contributions:
> >>
> >> THE EXPULSION OF STEVEN CROTHERS
> >>
> >> which was published in your issues of which I
> >> copied
> >> the first page
> >> below. The text of Crothers had the date 12th
> >> February 2006, Updated 21
> >> April 2006
> >>
> >> The spelling of the name Crothers is taken from
> >> his
> >> own statement.
> >> If you have problems finding his article please
> >> let
> >> em know.
> >>
> >> Regards
> >> Heinrich hora
```

ARCHIVEFREEDOM'S ADVICE TO HORA

Begin forwarded message:

```
>
> > From: Vic Christianto <vxianto@yahoo.com>
> > Date: Wed May 10, 2006 11:43:45 Australia/Sydney
> > To: Heinrich Hora <h.hora@unsw.edu.au>, Paul
> > LaViolette
> > <gravitics1@aol.com>, Paul LaViolette
> > <starburstfound@aol.com>
> > Cc: Carlos Castro <czarlosromanov@yahoo.com>,
> > Florentin Smarandache
> > <fsmarandache@yahoo.com>
> > Subject: Re: Reply to Mr. Crothers
> >
```

> > Dear Dr Heinrich Hora:
> >
> > Thank you for your kind reply. Now it is more
> clear on
> > this issue.
> >
> > With apologies, I think the homepage you are
> referring
> > to is www.archivefreedom.org not www.sciprint.org.
> > While these homepages have some linkage, me only
> > administer www.sciprint.org (for scientific
> > preprints), while the [archivefreedom.org](http://www.archivefreedom.org).
> >
> > Therefore, would you please write to Dr Paul
> > LaViolette <gravitics1@aol.com>, the administrator
> of
> > [archivefreedom.org](http://www.archivefreedom.org).
> >
> > Anyway, we would like to consider to upload your
> paper
> > in [sciprint.org](http://www.sciprint.org), if you wish.
> >
> > Thanks for your understanding and best wishes,
> >
> >
> > Victor C.
> > vxianto@yahoo.com
> > <http://www.sciprint.org>

ARCHIVEFREEDOM'S ADVICE TO ME

Tue, 9 May 2006
19:31:37 -0700
(PDT)

From:  "Vic Christiano" <vxianto@yahoo.com>  [Add to Address Book](#)
Yahoo! DomainKeys has confirmed that this message was sent by
[yahoo.com](mailto:vxianto@yahoo.com). [Learn more](#)
Subject:  Fwd: Reply to Mr. Crothers
To: "Stephen Crothers" <thenarmis@yahoo.com>
"Paul LaViolette" <gravitics1@aol.com>,  "Carlos Castro"
CC: <czarlosromanov@yahoo.com>,  "Florentin Smarandache"
<fsmarandache@yahoo.com>

Dear Dr Stephen Crothers:

With all my respect, allow me to forward to you a
recent letter from Dr Heinrich Hora.

He asks to Dr Paul LaViolette to upload his letter as
balanced information from your letter.

Hopefully you can be informed on this issue.

Best wishes,

Victor C.
vxianto@yahoo.com

MY RESPONSE TO ARCHIVEFREEDOM AND HORA

Wed, 10 May
2006 21:23:11
+1000 (EST)

From: "Stephen Crothers" <thenarmis@yahoo.com>  [Add to Address Book](#)
Subject:  Re: Fwd: Reply to Mr. Crothers
To:  "Vic Christianto" <vxianto@yahoo.com>
h.hora@unsw.edu.au,  "Dmitri Rabounski"
CC: <rabounski@yahoo.com>, "Jeremy Dunning-Davies" <j.dunning-davies@hull.ac.uk>, "Dr. Bernard Lavenda"
<bernard.lavenda@unicam.it>

Dear Victor,

Thanks for the letter from Prof. H. Hora. It is of course to be expected that the University of New South Wales officials will be upset by my revelation of the despicable behaviour of its physics professors and its academic committee. Prof. Hora has attempted to defend the indefensible. My open letter is fully documented, containing the letters and reports written by the parties involved. Hora offers no evidence that I have embellished or otherwise distorted the true facts. I retract nothing. Hora evidently sees nothing wrong with Hamer altering my research and misrepresenting me in a report to the Head of School and others. He sees no problem with Gal taking clandestine action to have me eliminated, by providing me with misleading information, and otherwise attempting to deceive me. He sees no problem with the Head of School, W. Couch, and the academic committee and the other professors ignoring my published works, or the misconduct and ineptitude of Hamer, or the acts or omissions of Flambaum, Kruchiev, Webb, etc.

My open letter will stand up in any court of law since it is supported by my material evidence which is irrefutable. Hora is concerned only by the fact that his University and his professors have been exposed in their true colours by this disgusting affair. He finds my remarks insulting. Well, I suppose that I have not been insulted by the actions of his professors, and I should take it all on the chin, and say nothing to

anyone. No, the culprits must be brought to book. And my expulsion is indeed an episode in the suppression of science, since it was my work which gave rise to their actions. My long experience as an erstwhile private detective will not permit me to let such dishonesty go unpunished. In future, I shall, at every opportunity, reveal the circumstances of my expulsion from the University of New South Wales. I find it curious that Hora is not dismayed by the revelation of these matters, and not taken any action against those responsible, but instead castigates me for being insulting of his staff.

I have no objection to Archivefreedom adding Hora's letter to its site in reply to me. Readers can judge for themselves, based upon the evidence. But I do not recommend that his letter be added for the simple reason that part of our aims are to reveal such dishonourable behaviour, not to provide a forum for the defendants to argue their case before a jury. Moreover, the University of New South Wales did not afford me equality before its tribunal.

Yours faithfully,
Stephen J. Crothers.

HORA'S EMAIL REQUEST

=====

--- Heinrich Hora <h.hora@unsw.edu.au> wrote:

> Date: Wed, 10 May 2006 12:21:25 +1000
> Subject: Fwd: Reply to Mr. Crothers
> CC: Vic Christiano <vxianto@yahoo.com>
> To: <gravitics1@aol.com>
> From: Heinrich Hora <h.hora@unsw.edu.au>
>
> Dear Dr. Paul Laviolette,
>
> with respect to the following contcat I had with Dr.
> Christiano I would
> like to submit the attached reply to Mr. Crothers
> for your publication.
> Please feel free to update my text and let me know
> when you will have
> this on your website.
>
> Thanks and regards
>
> Heinrich Hora

HORA'S REPLY TO ME

Thu, 11 May
2006 12:18:20
+1000

Subject: Re: Reply to Mr. Crothers
"Vic Christianto" <vxianto@yahoo.com>, "Dmitri Rabounski" <rabounski@yahoo.com>, "Jeremy Dunning-Davies" <j.dunning-davies@hull.ac.uk>, "Dr. Bernard Lavenda" <bernard.lavenda@unicam.it>
CC:
To: "Stephen Crothers" <thenarmis@yahoo.com>
From: "Heinrich Hora" <h.hora@unsw.edu.au>  [Add to Address Book](#)

Dear Mr. Crothers,

thanks for letting me know that you have no objection that my letter may be published by Archivefreedom.. I underline that my text did in now way discus any detail of your interaction with UNSW and I repeat that no judgment was given about your physics. I only explained that it is a duty only by a faculty to accept and support defending of students' results, and where nobody is found to do this, the institution cannot be blamed.

Sometimes, a supervisor may take a risk. Of my 20 Ph.D. students, in one case I was not sure whether all arguments in the thesis are correct. The global result was well reasonable and an important insight. After I succeeded to get a Nobel Laureate as examiner who was positive, I could forget my questions. In your case I regret that you did not take the chance to elaborate a thesis along the lines of possibilities.

Sincerely
Heinrich Hora

MY REPLY TO THAT NONSENSE

Thu, 11 May
2006
13:52:42
+1000 (EST)

From: "Stephen Crothers" <thenarmis@yahoo.com>  [Add to Address Book](#)
Subject: Re: Reply to Mr. Crothers
To: "Heinrich Hora" <h.hora@unsw.edu.au>
"Vic Christianto" <vxianto@yahoo.com>, "Dmitri Rabounski" <rabounski@yahoo.com>, "Jeremy Dunning-Davies" <j.dunning-davies@hull.ac.uk>, "Dr. Bernard Lavenda" <bernard.lavenda@unicam.it>, gravitics1@aol.com, 
CC: czarlosromanov@yahoo.com,  fsmarandache@yahoo.com

Dear Professor Hora,

But in my case UNSW and its professors are to blame. My research cannot just be altered, either deliberately or by incompetence, by its professors. And outright refusal to read any papers or even meet for discussion on the grounds that I cannot be right is not scientific method. So your faculty failed miserably in its duties by both act and omission, and so your institution and its relevant professors are culpable, and guilty of suppression. I therefore stand by my charges.

Yours faithfully,
Stephen J. Crothers.

HORA'S INCOHERENT LAST WORDS

Thu, 11 May 2006 16:31:55

+1000

Subject: Re: Reply to Mr. Crothers
From: "Heinrich Hora" <h.hora@unsw.edu.au>  [Add to Address Book](#)
To: "Stephen Crothers" <thenarmis@yahoo.com>

Dear Mr. Crothers,

good that you again formulate your position. My remarks are not directly going into each arguments but mentioning that in such situations there may be more complicate conditions. This does not charge the one or the other side but should help to differentiate.
Yours faithfully
Heinrich Hora